# **EXHIBIT 23**

# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MINNESOTA

FAIR ISAAC CORPORATION,

Plaintiff,

v.

FEDERAL INSURANCE COMPANY, and ACE AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY

Defendants.

Case No. 16-CV-1054(WMW/DTS)

EXPERT REPORT OF NEIL J. ZOLTOWSKI WITH RESPECT TO DAMAGES

Respectfully submitted this 19th day of April, 2019

CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY

# c) Broker Site

97. Broker Site is "a front-end quoting system" integrated with Evolution in Canada.<sup>200</sup> It also allows brokers to access information and documents such as billing and claims information and reference libraries of contract guides, rates and rules, product highlights, training and webcasts.<sup>201</sup> It is used in Defendants' Personal and Commercial lines to help brokers manage their clients. Broker Site interfaces with and draws information from the Evolution policy administration system.<sup>202</sup>

#### d) Adapt

98. Adapt is the policy administration application used in the United Kingdom, Australia, and other European Countries.<sup>203</sup> It is broker-facing and allows for real-time binding and issuing of policies and is used for, among other things, back-end administration, automation, document generation and electronic filing.<sup>204</sup> Adapt also enables a broker to view and manage his or her own portfolio.<sup>205</sup> Adapt has been used in Australia since 2007 for the A&H business unit and applies business rules in Blaze Advisor for underwriting guidance.<sup>206</sup>

#### e) Exari

99. Exari functions as an additional data collection source following EZER's initial data collection.<sup>207</sup> This iterative data collection reduces the underwriter's time and effort.<sup>208</sup> Chubb canceled the Exari project at or around January 27, 2016, the time that ACE Limited acquired Chubb Corp.<sup>209</sup>

 $<sup>^{200}</sup>$  Federal Insurance Company's Fifth Supplemental Answer to Plaintiff's Interrogatory No. 19, dated March 2, 2019 at 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>201</sup> FED04571 at "Application Summary" worksheet.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> Mirolyuz 1/11/19 Deposition at 72-73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> FED014390 0006 and 010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> FED014390 0006.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> FED014390 0006.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>206</sup> Mirolyuz 1/11/19 Deposition at 69; Federal Insurance Company's Fifth Supplemental Answer to Plaintiff's Interrogatory No. 20, dated March 21, 2019 at 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> FED008352 0001.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> FED008352 0001.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> FED017913 0001-002.

#### Fair Isaac Corporation v. Federal Insurance Company and ACE American Insurance Company

# **SCHEDULE 5.0: Summary of Lost Fees for Foreign Applications**

		Li	cense,				
Foreign Application	Region	Supp	oort, and enance (a)	Start Date	End Date (b)	Years	Total Lost Fees
ADAPT	Australia	\$					
ADAPT	U.K.						
Evolution	Australia						
Evolution	Canada						
EZER	U.K. and Europe						
Exari	U.K.						
Broker Site	Canada						
	Total	\$	3,302,235		-	9	21,262,691

#### *Note/Source(s):*

- (a) See Schedule 7.0.
- (b) I understand the trial ready date is December 9, 2019.
- (c) I understand the damages period starts at the latter of the first year of gross written premiums reported per interrogatory responses or 6 years before the filing date of April 21, 2016 (i.e., April 21, 2010). See **Schedule 12.0**.
- (d) I understand FICO asserts that ADAPT (Europe) was used in 2009. (FED014415 0001-0003.)
- (e) I understand FICO asserts that Evolution (Canada) was used in 2013. Further, I understand the Broker Site application is integrated with the Evolution (Canada) application. (Mirolyuz 1/11/2019 Deposition at Exhibit 186 (FED008481 0001-FED008482 0001); Harkin Deposition at 206-209.)
- (f) I understand the development of the Exari application started in 2013 and was abandoned in 2016. (Mirolyuz 1/11/2019 Deposition at Exhibit 187 (FED12301\_0001; FED12303-0001); FED017913 0001-0002.)

# Fair Isaac Corporation v. Federal Insurance Company and ACE American Insurance Company

# **SCHEDULE 9.0: Summary of Defendants' Foreign Gross Written Premiums**

#### April 21, 2013 to March 2019

Foreign		All Writing			Chubb Corporation and Chubb INA Holdings, Inc.	Federal, Subsidiaries and Pooling	Non- Subsidiaries and Non-Pooling			
<b>Applications</b>	Region	(	Companies (a)		Subsidiaries (b)	Entities (c)	Entities (d)			
ADAPT	Australia	\$	104,643,020	\$	104,643,020	\$ 76,090,876	\$	28,552,143		
ADAPT	U.K.		265,034,167		265,034,167	213,529,232		51,504,935		
Evolution	Australia		87,984,461		87,984,461	-		87,984,461		
Evolution (e)	Canada		1,278,000,000		1,278,000,000	534,000,000		744,000,000		
EZER	Europe		786,223,356		786,223,356	672,408,758		113,814,598		
EZER	U.K.		15,477		15,477	15,477		-		
Broker Site (e)	Canada		n/a		n/a	n/a		n/a		
TOTAL		\$	2,521,900,482	\$	2,521,900,482	\$ 1,496,044,344	\$	1,025,856,138		

#### *Note/Source(s):*

- (a) See Schedule 11.1.
- (b) See Schedule 11.2.
- (c) See Schedule 11.3.
- (d) Calculated as the difference between (b) and (c).
- (e) I understand the Evolution (Canada) and Broker Site (Canada) applications share the same underlying database and therefore report the same gross written premiums. (Harkin Deposition at 206-209.)

#### Fair Isaac Corporation v. Federal Insurance Company and ACE American Insurance Company

# SCHEDULE 11.1: Summary of Foreign Gross Written Premiums by Application - All Writing Companies (a)

Application	Region	Aŗ	or 21 - Dec 31 2013 (b)	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Jan - Mar 2019 (c)	Total
ADAPT	Australia	\$	18,563,675	\$ 26,580,572	\$ 25,345,604	\$ 22,404,103	\$ 7,512,511	\$ 4,049,851	\$ 186,704	\$ 104,643,020
ADAPT	U.K.		44,264,795	60,130,370	61,438,935	47,695,132	40,226,219	11,278,716	-	265,034,167
Evolution	Australia		-	-	-	-	992,514	76,787,952	10,203,995	87,984,461
Evolution (d)	Canada		-	-	303,000,000	308,000,000	330,000,000	337,000,000	-	1,278,000,000
EZER	Europe		140,017,446	196,353,338	179,188,308	156,849,666	109,376,325	4,438,273	-	786,223,356
EZER	U.K.		-	7,833	3,515	4,130	-	-	-	15,477
Broker Site (d)	Canada		n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
TOTAL		\$	202,845,915	\$ 283,072,112	\$ 568,976,362	\$ 534,953,031	\$ 488,107,569	\$ 433,554,792	\$ 10,390,699	\$ 2,521,900,482

#### *Note/Source(s):*

- (a) This schedule includes gross written premiums from all writing companies reported per Defendants' interrogatory responses. See Schedule 12.0.
- (b) I understand that copyright remedies are limited to three years before the filing of a complaint (i.e., April 21, 2016). I have adjusted the gross written premiums accordingly.
- (c) The Defendant's most recent responses to Interrogatory Nos. 16-20 were dated March 2, 2019 and March 21, 2019.
- (d) Defendants reported that the Evolution (Canada) and Broker Site (Canada) applications share the same underlying database and therefore report the same gross written premiums. (Harkin Deposition at 206-209.)